



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

September 6, 2019

Dean Glasscock
Arbor Art Tree Care, Inc.
808 Heathcote Avenue
Nashville, TN 37210
Re: **RFQ# 1189657, Tree Care Services**

Dear Mr. Glasscock:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above **RFQ# 1189657, Tree Care Services**. This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to **Arbor Art Tree Care, Inc.**, contingent upon successful contract negotiations. Please provide a certificate of Insurance indicating all applicable coverages within 15 business days of the receipt of this letter.

If the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification.

Additionally the awardee will be required to submit evidence of participation of and contractor's payment to all Small, Minority, and Women Owned Businesses participation in any resultant contract. This evidence shall be submitted monthly and include copies of subcontracts or purchase orders, the Prime Contractor's Application for Payment, or invoices, and cancelled checks or other supporting payment documents. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact **JoeAnn Carr**, BAO Representative, at **(615) 880-2338** or at joeann.carr@nashville.gov.

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Buyer **Genario Pittman** by email at genario.pittman@nashville.gov Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Michelle A. Hernandez Lane".

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File, Other Offerors

Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.

A. Right to Protest. Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.

Procurement Division

730 Second Avenue South, Suite 112
P.O. Box 196300
Nashville, Tennessee 37219-6300

www.Nashville.gov
Phone: 615-862-6180
Fax: 615-862-6179



METROPOLITAN GOVERNMENT OF NASHVILLE AND DAVIDSON COUNTY

September 6, 2019

Scott Johnson
The Davey Tree Expert Company
1500 North Mantua Street
Kent, OH 44240
Re: **RFQ# 1189657, Tree Care Services**

Dear Mr. Johnson:

The Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County (Metro) has completed the evaluation of submitted solicitation offer(s) to the above **RFQ# 1189657, Tree Care Services**. This letter hereby notifies you of Metro's intent to award to **The Davey Tree Expert Company**, contingent upon successful contract negotiations. Please provide a certificate of Insurance indicating all applicable coverages within 15 business days of the receipt of this letter.

If the Procurement Nondiscrimination Program requirements were a part of this solicitation, the awardee must forward a signed copy of the "Letter of Intent to Perform as Subcontractor/Subconsultant/Supplier/Joint Venture" for any minority/women-owned business enterprises included in the response to the Business Assistance Office within two business days from this notification.

Additionally the awardee will be required to submit evidence of participation of and contractor's payment to all Small, Minority, and Women Owned Businesses participation in any resultant contract. This evidence shall be submitted monthly and include copies of subcontracts or purchase orders, the Prime Contractor's Application for Payment, or invoices, and cancelled checks or other supporting payment documents. Should you have any questions concerning this requirement, please contact **JoeAnn Carr**, BAO Representative, at **(615) 880-2338** or at joeann.carr@nashville.gov.

Depending on the file sizes, the responses to the procurement solicitation and supporting award documentation can be made available either by email, CD for pickup, or in person for inspection. If you desire to receive or review the documentation or have any questions, please contact Buyer **Genario Pittman** by email at genario.pittman@nashville.gov Monday through Friday between 8:30am and 3:30pm.

Thank you for participating in Metro's competitive procurement process.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Michelle A. Hernandez Lane".

Michelle A. Hernandez Lane
Purchasing Agent

Cc: Solicitation File, Other Offerors

Pursuant to M.C.L. 4.36.010 Authority to resolve protested solicitations and awards.

A. Right to Protest. Any actual or prospective bidder, offeror or contractor who is aggrieved in connection with the solicitation or award of a contract may protest to the Purchasing Agent. The protest shall be submitted in writing within ten (10) days after such aggrieved person knows or should have known of the facts giving rise thereto.

Procurement Division

730 Second Avenue South, Suite 112
P.O. Box 196300
Nashville, Tennessee 37219-6300

www.Nashville.gov
Phone: 615-862-6180
Fax: 615-862-6179

RFQ# 1189657 Tree Care Services		
Evaluation Criteria (Max Points)	Arbor Art Tree Care, Inc.	The Davey Tree Expert Company
Team Qualifications, Experience, and Capacity to Perform (25 Points)	15	21
Project Approach and Process (40 Points)	28	38
Cost Criteria (35 Points)	35	29.46
Total (100 Points)	78.00	88.46
Strengths & Weaknesses		

Arbor Art Tree Care, Inc. (78.00 Points)

Strengths: Firm provided a detailed list of their equipment. Firm provided a detailed process for their communication system used to assign, track, and evaluate work performed. Firm provided a detailed approach for the technology and tools used to stay innovative to provide services associated with the scope of work. Firm provided a detailed description of how they promote sustainable environmental practices related to tree care.

Weaknesses: Firm failed to describe their management personnel's experience with accounts of similar size, scope, and company structure. Firm's outline regarding their experience meeting the needs of other organizations similar to Metro lacked specific details. Firm only provided a copy of one type of license associated with performing services for the scope work. Firm's comprehensive methodology used to complete the scope of work lacked specific details. Firm failed to provide their safety plan. Firm failed to provide an approach for the annual pruning program. Firm's quality control plan lacked specific details.

The Davey Tree Expert Company (89.46 Points)

Strengths: Firm provided a detailed description of their management personnel's experience with accounts of similar size, scope, and company structure. Firm provided a detailed list of their equipment. Firm provided a detailed process for their communication system used to assign, track, and evaluate work performed. Firm provided a detailed process for management of green waste recycling. Firm provided a detailed description of how they promote sustainable environmental practices related to tree care.

Weaknesses: Firm's outline regarding company experience meeting the needs of other organizations similar to Metro lacked specific details. Firm failed to provide a copy of licenses associated with performing the scope of work. Firm's safety plan lacked specific details. Firm's approach for their annual pruning program associated with the scope of work lacked specific details.

Solicitation Title & Number		RFP Cost Points	Total Cost Points
Tree Care Services; RFQ# 1189657		35	35
Offeror's Name	Total Bid Amount	RFP Cost Points	Total Cost Points
Arbor Art Tree Care, Inc.	\$2,205,000.00	35.00	35.00
The Davey Tree Expert Company	\$2,620,000.00	29.46	29.46

BAO SBE Assessment Sheet

BAO Specialist: Carr, JoeAnn
Contract Specialist: Genario Pittman
8/28/2019

Department Name: General Services
RFP/ITB Number: 1189657

Project Name: Tree Care Services

Primary Contractor*	Prime Bid Amount	Total Proposed SBE (\$)	SBE Subs approved?	SBE (%)	Comments
Arbor Art Tree Care, Inc.					All offerors are relieved of the requirement to meet 20% SBE/SDV requirement as the available market does not support this requirement.
The Davey Tree Expert Company					All offerors are relieved of the requirement to meet 20% SBE/SDV requirement as the available market does not support this requirement.

PNP Compliance Results Form

Department Name: General Services

RFP/ITB Number: 1189657

Procurement Name: Tree Care Services

Primary Contractor	PNP Compliant (Yes/No)	Determination Comments/% of Participation Proposed or Bid
Arbor Art Tree Care, Inc.	Yes	All offerors are relieved of the requirement to comply with PNP because of no availability (lack of program applicability).
The Davey Tree Expert Company		All offerors are relieved of the requirement to comply with PNP because of no availability (lack of program applicability).

*Denotes Contractor with whom follow up was required

Date: 08/28/2019

Metro Buyer: Genario Pittman

BAO Rep: JoeAnn Carr